

Improving Access to Clean Water, Sanitation, Preventive Health Care and Income Generation Opportunities in Rural Burkina Faso – Areole Commune in Passoré Province, 2013-2014

Amount of Grant Aid Awards £39,241

Application Number - 2013/061/BUK008

Final Evaluation

Croix Rouge Burkina Faso (CRBF)

Red Cross of Burkina Faso

Evaluation Period: 16 – 25 July 2014

Evaluator:

Koffi Ahanogbe, Regional Programme Manager, West and Central Africa, HelpAge International

Table of Contents

Pages

List of Acronyms:……………………………………………………………………………………….3

Executive Summary…………………………………………………………………………………….4

1. Background………………………………………………………………………………..5
2. Evaluation Objectives and methodology……………………………………………….5
3. Findings……………………………………………………………………………………..6
4. Problems encountered……………………………………………………………………..8
5. Analysis of findings and comments………………………………………………………9
6. Recommendations………………………………………………………………………… 9
7. Sustainability ………………………………………………………………………………10
8. Conclusion………………………………………………………………………………….11

Attachments:

* List of people met and interviewed
* Meeting the Red Cross Burkina Faso President
* Meeting with beneficiaries: income generation groups
* Meeting with a family latrine beneficiary (male)
* Meeting with a family latrine beneficiary (female)
* Picture of water borehole
* Pictures of community latrines
* Case studies

List of Acronyms

APF : Association pour la Promotion de la Femme et de l’Enfant au Passoré

AIS : Agent Itinéraire de Santé : Roving Health Agent

AU : Accoucheuse Auxiliaire : Auxiliary Midwife

CRBF: Croix Rouge Burkina Faso: Red Cross of Burkina Faso

CSPS : Centre de Santé et de Promotion Social d’Arbollé : Health and Social Promotion Centre of Arbollé

EWCARDC: East West and Central Africa Regional Development Centre

PFDS: Promo Femme Développement Solidarité

CEO: Chief Executive Officer

CRBF: Croix Rouge du Burkina Faso

GOAC Guernsey Overseas Aid Commission

UE: Union Européenne, European Union

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

In its efforts to implement its Vision and Mission in Burkina Faso, HelpAge International assisted the Red Cross Burkina Faso in developing a Water and Sanitation proposal funded with a Grant from Guernsey to address older people’s issues in the Province of Passoré where older people protection is becoming more and more critical. In fact, in the very traditional Department of Passoré older people and especially women are accused for using witchcraft to kill babies. Yet most of these babies die of poor hygienic conditions prevailing in many villages of the department. So, constructing sanitation infrastructure such latrine, boreholes for potable water would reduce the death rate of babies hence prevent older people from being targeted, tortured and being killed. The project with a grant funded budget of £39,241 covered the period from April 2013 to March 2014 and was designed to construct one (1) borehole, three (3) community latrines, and thirty six (36) family latrines. Also, the project included a livelihood component targeting 100 older women provided each with grant start-up capital in form of 2 animals (male and female) for raising towards revenue increase and leaving condition improving.

Due to delay in fund release project implementation has been extended till July 2014. A final report is to be submitted to HelpAge Headquarters and to Donor Guernsey. HelpAge Regional Programme Manager for West and Central Africa Koffi Ahanogbe jointed Red Cross Burkina Faso to conduct a final evaluation in the period from 16 to 25 July 2014. The objective of the evaluation was to assess outputs, outcome, achievements, problems encountered, lessons learned, and formulate suggestions and recommendations for improvement in similar projects in the future or for better replication elsewhere. The methodology adopted for this evaluation included documentary desktop revue of all project documents, monitoring and activity reports, interview with Red Cross Burkina Faso senior and project staff, partner institutions, beneficiaries and non beneficiaries not forgetting HelpAge staff involved in the management of this project,

A visit to project site to look at achievements in Areole and other villages, and interviews with project staff, partner institutions and beneficiaries revealed that almost all project objectives were achieved: 36 family latrines, 3 community latrines were constructed. One (1) water borehole was constructed. Also 100 older people (women) were provided with grant start-up capital in form or 2 animals each for raising to increase their revenues towards living condition improvement. However only 20 people were trained to become hygiene volunteers compared to 24 projected. The project encountered a certain number of problems which did not prevent from achieving the objectives. These problems include communication problems due to language barriers as HelpAge’s working language is English while Red Cross Burkina Faso is French speaking in a francophone country being Burkina Faso resulting in incorrect reporting. Other problems encountered related to inadequate budget line items namely monitoring, and timing for project activities. Overall, project implementation was very successful with a high sustainability potential as beneficiaries owned the project and were empowered through training so ensure that their communities further enjoy development spin off of the project in terms of permanent water supply from sustained water and sanitation infrastructure while 100 older people will improve their living conditions through income generating activities. Consequently it is highly recommended to develop subsequent project to further secure protection for older people in the Passoré Province.

1. **BACKGROUND**

In the absence of Country Programme in Burkina Faso, HelpAge embarked on partnership with the Red Cross Burkina Faso to implement is Vision and Mission by tackling some issues affecting older people seriously in the Province of Passoré in Burkina Faso. Due to poor hygienic conditions many babies die in this Province. Unaware of poor hygienic conditions being the real cause of babies’ death, many people in communities concerned would accuse older people of killing babies through witchcraft. In order to contribute to efforts towards addressing this issue in the country HelpAge and Red Cross Burkina Faso jointly developed two (2) water and sanitation projects which were implemented in 2008 and 2010 respectively in this Province. A third project funded through a grant from GOAC was initiated in April 2013. This project has come to an end in July 2014 after extension due to some delay in implementation. The final project report is now due and should include an evaluation report as reflected in the project budget. So, HelpAge Regional Programme Manager, West and Central Africa was tasked to conduct this evaluation in the period of 16 to 25 July 2014. The following is the report of this evaluation reflecting output, outcome, objectives, lessons learned and suggestions and recommendations for the way further in tackling older people’s issues in Burkina Faso.

1. **EVALUATION OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY**
2. **Objectives:**

The purpose of the evaluation of this BUK008 Project is to assess the extent to which the set objectives have been achieved. Also the pertinence, the effectiveness and the efficiency of the project will be assessed and analyzed towards improving access to clean water, sanitation, preventive health care and income generation opportunities in rural Burkina Faso in the Arbollé Department located in the Passoré Province. In order words, it will be necessary to find out whether or not this project is appropriate to address the issues identified and whether it had its effect as «a useful medicine towards healing the socio-economic pain of water borne diseases and poverty affecting rural populations in general and older people in particular». Last but not least, the question will be to determine whether the right thing has been done right in the context of this project to reach results expected.

1. **Methodology**

The approach used to conduct this evaluation was a participatory one involving HelpAge staff, employees of the implementation partner institution being the Red Cross of Burkina Faso, beneficiaries or target groups, and stakeholders. Specifically, one HelpAge staff being the Regional Programme Manager for West and Central Africa led the evaluation exercise. On the side of the project implementation partner institution we noted the participation of the programme coordinator, three hygienists and the accountant of Red Cross of Burkina Faso. Also, beneficiaries participated in the evaluation exercise.

The evaluation methodology also included the following:

* Documentary review of project design documents
* Project monitoring reports
* Project phase reports
* Project Interim report
* Interviews with Red Cross Burkina Faso President, CEO and staff (Logistician, Accountant and field technicians
* Project staff including Hygiene Volunteers,
* Partners Institutions
* Beneficiaries
* Non beneficiaries

Two field visits took place that led the evaluation team to project site to assess project achievements and meet project target groups including community leaders, a health center, family and community latrines and two (2) boreholes.

Interviews were conducted with beneficiaries including community leaders, older people, people who benefited from income generating activities focusing on animal raising. In the same context, beneficiary communities of previous projects were interviewed to assess the sustainability aspects of such a project. Stakeholders and partner institutions’ staff members were also interviewed to collect their opinion on project implementation, problems encountered and how they were dealt with.

1. **FINDINGS**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1. **Projected Budget** | | |
| **Project requirements** | **GBP** | |
| Project staff (Programme Coordinator, Project Officer and Finance) | 7,379 | |
| Survey and identification of beneficiaries | 356 | |
| Drilling, construction and installation of water borehole | 7,537 | |
| Training on borehole management and maintenance | 166 | |
| Construction of 36 family latrines | 9,612 | |
| Construction of 3 community latrines | 1,842 | |
| Workshops to train hygiene volunteers (4 volunteers per village = 24) for 2 days | 561 | |
| 6 community sensitization workshops on hygiene and the use of latrines (1 per village) | 678 | |
| Income generation training workshop for 120 older people (40 people per workshop) | 1,151 | |
| Micro-grants for income generation activities for 100 older people @ £50.25 | 5,025 | |
| Communication and materials | 684 | |
| Monitoring | 905 | |
| Evaluation | 3,345 | |
| **TOTAL** | **39,241** | |
|  | | |

1. **Achieved Project Outputs**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| No | ITEMS | Projected outputs | Achieved outputs | Comments |
| 1 | Bore holes | 1 | 1 |  |
| 2 | Community latrines | 3 | 3 |  |
| 3 | Family latrines | 36 | 36 |  |
| 4 | Income generating beneficiaries | 100 | 100 |  |
| 5 | Training of hygienists | 24 | 20 | Gap of 4 |
| 6 | Villages involved | 6 | 6 |  |

The BUK008 project was implemented in 6 villages located in the Department of Arbollé in the Passoré Province.

The water borehole is in place and the three (3) community latrines as well. The evaluation team visited two (2) of these community latrines in Zongbeiga and Boulkon respectively. The projected 36 family latrines were constructed. And 3000 community members acquired better knowledge about the importance of improved water and sanitation and the use of water point through better hygienic behavior. The evaluation team located and assessed the shape of four (4) of them. Also the evaluation team met four (4) of the one hundred (100) older people served with micro grants for income generating activities, namely animal raising.

In terms of capacity strengthening deliverables included the training of 20 hygiene volunteers called hygienists who are supporting rural communities including older people.

The evaluation team visited a bore hole from a previous Water and Sanitation project. The idea behind this visit was to find out whether and how communities are managing and maintaining their infrastructure towards sustainability over time.

Facilities visited include:

* One (1) new water borehole
* Two (2) of the 3 community latrines
* Two (2) of the 36 family latrines)
* One (1) water borehole from a previous project

One (1) community latrine from a previous project was visited in addition to 2 family latrines.

1. **PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED**
2. **Delay in release of fund**

Scheduled to start in 1st April 2013 project activities began in August 2013 only, the result being a delay in achieving the objectives as some activities could be implemented only in specific seasons. For instance, you cannot drill water boreholes during the rainy season but during the dry season only; on the other hand, people prefer focusing on animal raising during the dry season rather than during the rainy season as the rainy season is mainly devoted to farming activities in a country where most people live in rural areas where agricultural activities are predominant.

1. **Communication problem**

Burkina Faso is a French speaking country. Accordingly French is the working language at the Red Cross Burkina Faso Iocated in Ouagadougou, the capital city of the country. The former HelpAge Programme Manager based in Nairobi made commendable efforts to contribute to effective communication by providing to EWCARDC summaries of reports in English. However projects documents are in English and communication (emails) from EWCARDC in Nairobi to Red Cross Burkina Faso was in English. This resulted in repeated correspondence and questions back and forth to understand questions from EWCARD and in order to provide appropriate explanations and response: this was critical as far as accounting, financial management and reporting were concerned.

1. **Inadequate budget line items**

The budget included a very little budget line item for monitoring (£905). Yet it was absolutely necessary to visit project site more frequently as expected in order to meet beneficiaries and partners to ensure a smooth project implementation towards achieving objectives set. So, it became difficult to effectively and closely monitor the project from Ouagadougou where Red Cross Burkina Faso is headquartered and from HelpAge Regional Office in Nairobi. When, unfortunately the accountant of Red Cross Burkina Faso passed away, it became necessary to HelpAge Regional Coordinator to travel to Burkina Faso together with a Regional Finance Department staff to train a Red Cross Burkina Faso replacement staff on HelpAge Finance and Reporting rules. Money budgeted for project evaluation was then used to address this emergency situation. As a result, EWCARDC had to find other ways and means to conduct this final project evaluation exercise whose output is the present evaluation report. Also the budget foreseen for some activities proved to be inadequate as it did not allow implement some activities straight away. For instance some activities such as waterborehole construction have proved more expensive than originally budget for the result being lengthy bargaining with the service providers to adjust and reach consent.

This has resulted in exceeding the project budget by £347. Ed Cross Burkina Faso made effort to cover this. Furthermore there was the need for more fuel and maintenance of the vehicle used in addition to petty trip allowances for project staff training (hygiene volunteers).

1. **ANALYSIS OF FINDING AND COMMENTS**

The achievement of project objectives is obvious. The outputs are tangible and can be seen even though there was significant delay in the completion of some of them due to delay in fund release which did not comply with the action plan set the result being the extension of the project duration in other to carry out all activities projected and achieve all project objectives. At the end almost all objectives have been achieved: 1 water borehole has been put in place. A total of 36 family latrines and 3 community latrines have been constructed. One hundred (100) older people (ladies) were provided with start-up grant capital in form of animals to help them undertake income generating activity for revenue increase towards improve living conditions. Ten community meetings were organized on market days for awareness raising on hygiene, water point management and maintenance.

One output which could not be totally achieved was the training of hygiene volunteers. In fact only 20 out of 24 volunteers could be trained to become Hygiene Volunteers. Four people selected for the training left: according to them the reason was that the daily allowance for transportation and food was not adequate.

Cooperation between the logistics department and other departments within Red Cross Burkina unfolded smoothly and did not experience any impediment which could have negatively affected project implementation. Likewise the relationship between Red Cross Burkina Faso and stakeholders and other services providers proved to be positive and conducive for project implementation and for cooperation beyond this project.

1. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Looking at different aspects of this project as implemented the following recommendations are formulated towards improvement in similar venture in the future.

**Communication**: communication was critical and will be critical for cooperation between partners, donors and stakeholders. In the specific case of this project language barrier needs to be effectively addressed. HelpAge International is mainly English speaking while the partner Red Cross and the country of Red Cross (Burkina Faso) is French speaking. It would be helpful to make sure that project documents are translated into French and discussed with all project actors so that they clearly understand their responsibilities and roles prior to project implementation.

**Budgeting:** obviously, there was some inconsistency between specific activities and related budget line items, namely, monitoring, training and output. It would be helpful to effectively and thoroughly discuss budget line items while defining project budget in order to avoid «surprises» during the implementation phase. All project activities should be adequately budgeted for thereby clarifying who should cover them be it the donor or the implementation partner.

**Timing:** project implementation plan will need to focus more on timing in order to line up with seasons in the country whenever possible. In fact some activities can be carried out effectively and efficiently during specific times or seasons only. For instance boreholes are drilled and latrines constructed preferably during dry seasons rather than in raining seasons because shallow water level during raining season is «misleading» for water infrastructure, and makes work difficult for latrine construction. Likewise delay in release of funding would result in delay of activities by several months.

**Perspectives for the future:** Water & Sanitation project is a strong and effective strategy for addressing Protection issues for older people in that by saving babies’ lives through improved hygiene older people (women) would no longer be targeted as «Baby killers through witchcraft». In a Province prone to attacks on older people based on ancestral beliefs there is the need to replicate this project in several other Departments of this Province hence a very strong recommendation to both HelpAge a GOAC to seriously envision a subsequent Water & Sanitation project in the Passoré Province in Burkina Faso.

1. **SUSTAINABILITY**

It appeared too early to assess the sustainability aspect of this project because it has just come to an end as sustainability, among other things, is about the project being able to provide the same services to beneficiaries in the long run without any further support or assistance from implementing organization and other people or organization. However, the evaluation team visited some achievements of previous similar projects funded by the same donor in 2008 focusing on water and sanitation and bore holes.

A visit to the village of Kienssimyiri revealed that the water borehole infrastructure constructed there in the 2008 project is still providing water to the community concerned. The community has been able to autonomously manage the bore hole and carry out repair works at the pump broke down. This was possible because community members used to pay water users’ fees. Collected fees were partly used for repair work. Currently there is an amount of $100 in the community cash box as reserve funds for eventual repairs again in the future. Given the maturity of the community, fee payment is no longer compulsory. The community would simply convene all members who would then spontaneously contribute money for any repair work. A second visit to Boulkon city showed that the community latrine put in place there in 2008 is still being used and maintained by the community properly and is clean

In discussion with community leaders and members, Red Cross Burkina Faso and beneficiaries, the evaluation team noted a strong commitment on the part of the community to effectively and efficiently use, manage and maintain the latrine constructed for their own benefit.

Concerning both latrines and bore holes communities have reached a high awareness level on the importance of these infrastructures as they would never like getting back again in the situation where they had to walk time consuming, long distances to get some unclean backwater to meet their daily needs.

In terms of income generating activities (IGA), it has become a culture in the communities with animal raising that beneficiaries would meet to discuss their animal raising issues and help one another to overcome problems they may encounter. For instance, if some older person loses his/her animal through a disease or in any other circumstances, other older people would «lend» him or her an animal in replacement of the animal lost. The older person would “reimburse” later on the animal he or she had «borrowed» from his or her «older colleague». So, this project has contributed to the settlement of «Older people’s animal raising community». This is undoubtedly a strong basis for the socio-economic sustainability of such a project.

Also, this project has strong sustainability component which reside in it capacity to secure protection for older people. In the past, when small babies died due to poor hygienic conditions, older people, especially «older grand-moms» were accused of killing those babies through witchcraft: they were then beaten up, tortured and even killed in the one way or another. So, thank to water and sanitation projects no more many babies would die, and so older people would enjoy longer life within their community. This highlights the strong Protection aspect of HelpAge Vision of providing secure life to older people.

Furthermore, this project has a strong sustainability effect on the partner institution, the Red Cross of Burkina Faso, as this institution has added another dimension to its first aid and help capacity. In addition Red Cross Burkina Faso can claim to have acquired Waster & Sanitation skills and expertise for having successfully implemented this project.

Last but not least, HelpAge has gained more experience in terms of older people’s protection through Water & Sanitation projects implemented by partners though jointly developed projects.

1. **CONCLUSION**

Overall we can state that the implementation of this project was successful. Yes, we can also state that the project was a successful one as almost all objectives have been achieved in spite of difficulties and the communications issues that both Red Cross Burkina Faso and HelpAge have managed to overcome. In fact though the successful implementation of this project, it has been possible to Red Cross Burkina Faso, a partner institution, to carry out this venture and to provide Water and Sanitation infrastructure to many community members in the Department of Areole, Passoré Province in Burkina Faso, along with income generation basis to 100 older people (women) to help them escape poverty and sustain their lives. Development work always includes challenges through which players learn more and more towards improving their intervention in subsequent ventures. The success and the lesson from this Water and Sanitation Project to secure Protection for older people should be one more encouragement to replicate such a project in Burkina Faso and elsewhere.